

Punjab Education Foundation Schools: A Public-Private Partnership Paradigm, its Effects and Repercussion

Author's Details:

⁽¹⁾Muhammad Arshad* ⁽²⁾Dr. Zia Ahmad Qamar

⁽¹⁾SST Science, Govt. Fazilka Islamia Model High School Pakpattan-Pakistan

⁽²⁾Teacher, Govt. High School No.1 haveli Lakha, Okara-Pakistan.

Abstract

Education is necessary for the personality development of human beings. There are different types of institutions working in Punjab, Pakistan like government and private institutions, technical institutions and religious institutions (Madrasas). There is another type of institution working on the base of the public; private partnership is Punjab Education Foundation (PEF) partner schools. The main purpose of this study was to provide snapshots of organizational structure and students outcomes of PEF partner schools. The researcher characterizes the practice that academic scope is administered within the PEF Schools through this articulation. The researcher developed a rating scale for gauging schooling process, and the annual result of Punjab Examination Commission (PEC) was taken as students outcomes. The Punjab Education Foundation schools; have an excellent organizational structure, better students' outcomes, enhanced enrollment, and quality education

Keywords: *punjab education foundation partner schools, students outcomes, punjab examination commission, organizational structure, enrollment.*

1. Introduction

The process of teaching and learning is better in private schools than other types of schools. The reason is that teachers' presence, teaching related activity, and teaching techniques lead to enhanced learning performance. The private schools show better quality like teaching approach, attendance of teacher, school achievement, reduced class size, discipline, rules, regulations and cost effectiveness as compared with other state schools. These factors make the parents thinking of private schools (Ashley et al., 2014).

Schools are expected to influence student achievement through management, policies, practices and the process carried out in the classroom. Schools focus on learners needs by allocating and deploying resources to perform learning activities. These activities are addressed via the professional development of the staff. The effective school structures including timetable, staff meetings, parent teacher meetings, school council and local community help in improving the learning environment of the schools. The learners are required to participate actively in the planning and management for providing a learning environment and smooth running of the learning process in the school. Active participation of learners, community and parent support help improve decisions about the learning of the students.

The head of the institutions has a responsibility to work with the parents and the local community to describe the requirements of the students and the school — the head of the institution in collaboration with stakeholders like AEOs, Dy.DEOs, DEOs and CEOs, parents, students and teacher chalk out purposes, mission, and goals of the school. The head of the school prepare and implement a school development plan and staff development plan. These plans, in turn, improve student's achievement. There are many school based plans and policies for assessment, evaluation and continuous monitoring of students. The head of the effective school formulates a process for assigning teaching assignment and for evaluating the performance of teachers. The head of the institution also establishes an atmosphere of trust, openness, and collaboration. The academicians and practitioners plan for learning of students at school level by utilizing curriculum, pedagogy and assessment schemes. The classroom plays a key role in linking education and the school. The shared and better understanding between teachers, students and the head of the institutions enable to improve the learning outcomes. The teachers plan, monitor and manage learning activities. The effective classroom has a task orientation to instruction for the students. The teaching style of teachers is very adaptable with the students. Teachers guide and instruct the learning process by providing motivations and reinforcements. The learning takes place in a cooperative and supportive atmosphere. All the teachers of school make all efforts to ensure the learning process to take place in a better environment (Pandya, 2011).

Education is of immense significance and used as a motivator for developing empower and progress for the people. The education actively plays an influential performance in developing human capabilities to enhance economic growth through the use of knowledge, creativity, innovation, and skills. The education is not just rehearsal for life but a life in itself. It has been reported that many districts of Punjab have achieved the 100% enrollment of out of school children (Malik, 2011).

Awan and Akmal (2015) evaluated that, the high attendance rate and highly qualified teaching staff increase the enrollment in the schools which ultimately elevates the literacy rate. The PEF play a vital role to increase the literacy rate. The Punjab education foundation partner schools put negligible financial pressure on the parents. The PEF enables to enhance the quality of teaching staff which help in the learning process of the students. The overall PEF helps to increase the enrollment and minimize the dropout in the partner schools which finally lead to enhance literacy rate in the province. The main objective of the PEF is the promotion of high quality education by providing financial and technological support to the PEF partner schools.

Schools are not functioning as aspired by the stakeholders and the stress of cut threat competitions. The certain experimental design has been brought in to bringing which makes it imperative to gauge the strengths and weakness of all such endeavors. Hence the present study aims at organizational structure, students' outcomes at Punjab Education Foundation partner schools in Punjab.

1.1 Objectives of the Study

The objectives of the study were:

1. To provide the real picture of the organizational structure of Punjab Education Foundation partner schools.
2. To highlight the achievement of students at Punjab Education Foundation partner schools.
3. To find out the enrollment level of Punjab Education Foundation partner schools.

1.2 Research Questions

The research questions of the study were:

1. What is the organizational structure of Punjab Education Foundation partner schools?
2. What is the achievement level of Punjab Education Foundation partner schools?
3. What is the enrollment level of Punjab Education Foundation partner schools?

2. Procedure and Method of the Study

The study was descriptive; survey approach was used to collect the data. All PEF partner schools of Punjab were the target population of the study. The researchers selected division of Sahiwal for the study by multi-stage sampling, and 146 schools were selected on a random basis. A self developed questionnaire was used to elaborate the organizational structure to seek the viewpoint of the respondents. The students' scores were the judge from the gazette of PEC of grade 8th.

Principals were the most suitable individuals to respond to the status of the organizational structure of any institution. Therefore, the data about the school organizational structure was collected from Principals.

3. Review of Related Literature

Alternatives to public provision and privatization, PPP are often touted as a “best of both worlds.” The public, private partnership is a best practice that communities can undertake to ensure that provide public value. PPP is a contract or an arrangement between a government and private sector. The provision of public services via the private sectors to meet the government needs and rewarding the private sector based on outputs (Sharma & Bindal, 2014).

Private participation in education field remains argumentative in many countries, but PPPs at the basic education level is growing. Many countries have brought out sophisticated funding based PPPs which involve government public finance through private sector for delivery of education services. PPP is practicing on those populations who are being disadvantaged by existing education delivery systems. PPP in the basic education sector is no panacea. Therefore, the program towards MDGs and necessary improvements in educational services will require much widen reform programs. However, public, private

partnerships are a very fruitful instrument for governments to accomplish their educational policy objectives (Larocque, 2008).

The utilitarian of the educational institutions is to flourish the people physically, mentally, psychologically, socially and spiritually. The education enhances and improves the economic, social, political and cultural life of the nation (Memon, 2007). According to Aziz et al., (2014), the educational reform must cover all sectors of the education system as Pakistan does not have the bliss to delay reforms in one sector until the other sector improves. Reform in every sector must be organized with well defined goals and objectives, focus on a basic set of areas such as governance, financing, human resources, and curriculum and address them all together rather than piecemeal.

Akhtar and Tariq (2015) analyzed the status of infrastructure, facilities, and level of achievement of the students at the secondary school level. Many schools lack in basic facilities, minimum land and majority have insufficient classrooms and furniture. Many schools have no science apparatus and library. Majority of schools have no multimedia and have insufficient computers to implement the modern techniques of teaching and learning. Largest numbers of schools have no tuck shop and insufficient washrooms and playgrounds. The urban and male schools have better facilities than rural and female schools.

The school environment having better physical infrastructure put a positive impact on student's academic achievement, behavioural and personality development, student's creativity and participation in co-curricular activities (Naz et al., 2012). The education system is based on teachers and students. Primary education is a global challenge as every child of the country has to be accommodated because of the basic right to get an education. The performance of the school is indicated by the following parameters; administration, physical facilities, school council and community, curricular activities, guidance and counseling (Habib & Iqbal 2010).

Structure of Punjab Education Foundation; Brief History

Punjab Education Foundation was established under “the Punjab Education Foundation Act of 1991 as an autonomous statutory body to encourage and promote education in the private sector operating on non-commercial/non-profit basis” The Punjab Education Foundation was “restructured under the Punjab Education Foundation Act-XII of 2004 for the promotion of education especially encouraging and supporting the effort of the private sector in providing education to the poor through public private partnership” (The Punjab Education Foundation Act of 2004).

The vision of Punjab Education Foundation

The vision of Punjab Education foundation is “to promote an educated society in partnership with the private sector to get access to the basic right of education in Punjab.”

The mission of the Punjab Education Foundation

The mission of Punjab Education Foundation is “Promotion of quality education through Public Private Partnership, encouraging and supporting the efforts of the private sector through technical and financial assistance, innovating and developing new instruments to champion wider educational opportunities to the underprivileged children at an affordable cost.”

The strategy of Punjab Education Foundation

The strategy of Punjab Education Foundation comprises the flexible and convenient approach. The features of the strategy are:

- Provision of “quality education through the private sector to low income people and technical assistance in the form of teacher training and professional development for privately managed schools of Punjab.”
- Support schools in rural, urban, and slums areas.
- Promote female education.
- Enhance enrollment and impart quality education.

Functions of the Punjab Education Foundation

The functions of the foundation are “the provision of financial assistance for the establishment, expansion, improvement, and management of educational institutions working under the umbrella of PEF” The foundation provides incentives to students, teachers and the educational institutions. The foundation promotes public, private partnership relating to education and provides technical education to educational institutions for testing policy interventions and innovative programs for replication. The Punjab Education Foundation also assists educational institutions in enhancing capacity building including training of teachers and raise of funds through donations, grants, and contributions. The Punjab Education Foundation is supporting more than 2.5 million deserving students through the private sector (The Punjab Education Foundation (Conduct of Business) Rules, 2005).

The governing body of the Punjab Education Foundation

The governing body of the foundation is a Board of Directors (BOD). The Board oversees the effectiveness of the management operations of the foundation and ensuring that the organization achieves its desired goals. The Board of Directors of Punjab Education Foundation is founded with 15 directors headed by the chairman with full financial and administrative powers for the tenure of three years.

Core Programs of Punjab Education Foundation

Punjab Education Foundation has undertaken certain initiatives and is offering four programs like Foundation Assisted School (FAS), New School program (NSP), Education Voucher Scheme (EVS) and Public School Support Program (PSSP).

Foundation Assisted School (FAS)

Foundation Assisted Schools (FAS) is the major program of Punjab Education Foundation in which financial assistance is provided to low income communities in the province of Punjab through public, private partnership. FAS program has outreach to all 36 districts of the province of Punjab containing almost 3500 partner schools which are selected through ten phases to fulfill the necessities of more than 1.77 million students. It provides financial and technical support to all the partner schools located in rural, urban and slum areas of Punjab along with the promotion of quality education. FAS adopts criteria, procedure, and SOPs for the selection of schools through open transparent and competitive mode. The objective of this program is “the provision of free and quality education to the marginalized strata of the society through the introduction of an innovative education system under public private partnership model” Public, private partnership model is pondered “to improve the quality of schools and their service delivery to the deserving students all over the Punjab”

The foundation assists the schools where the students get admission. The motto of the Punjab Education Foundation is to promote free access to quality education to poor children by providing finance to the partner schools in favour of students. The Punjab Education Foundation disburses funds to the account of partner schools on a monthly basis.

Schools are selected for partnership through the launching of a new phase which is advertised in leading national newspapers. The applicant school fulfills the prescribed criteria required to pass the quality assurance test. The quality assurance test qualified schools are physically inspected to check the infrastructure. The selected schools are offered to sign a partnership agreement with PEF. The authenticity of the document relevant to school and school owners are checked before entering into a partnership with FAS. These schools are called PEF-FAS partner schools. The partner schools have to undertake Quality Assurance Tests (QATs). In case the students fail twice the partnership of that school is cancelled (Punjab Education Foundation, Annual Report 2016).

New School Program (NSP)

New School Program is an initiative of PEF. In NSP, new schools are opened at sites where no public or PEF school exists within 1km radius having a population of at least 350 people. NSP encourages individual entrepreneurs and NGOs to operate schools under this program after signing of agreements. The objective of the program is to improve access to education in areas where such opportunities are either less or not available. It fulfills the educational needs of disadvantaged, out of school children and dropouts. A grace period of 6 months is provided to the partner schools to meet the minimum requirement of 50 enrollments, 2

classrooms, 2 teachers, drinking water and 1 toilet. NSP program has outreach to all 36 districts of the province of Punjab. The NSP ensures enrollment of out of school children and also retain the students through (a) providing guidelines to partners (b) assessment of students learning outcomes (c) monitoring and evaluation (d) professional development of school management and teaching staff, and (e) orientation sessions to establish a new school.

Education Voucher Scheme (EVS)

Education Voucher scheme program was started in 2006 and made operational in all districts of the province of Punjab. The aims of this program are “to provide quality education to benefit children belonging to less affluent areas in urban slums and shanty towns of Punjab who cannot get an education due to financial and social constraints” The EVS beneficiary has age group of 5-16 years. The voucher is redeemable against payment of a fee in the PEF-EVS partner schools. The vouchers are issued and distributed to registered children/parents. The students submit these vouchers to PEF-EVS partner schools and the partner schools claim payment for these collected vouchers from PEF. Through this scheme, the poorest of the poor have freedom of choice to send their children to the schools of their own liking (Punjab Education Foundation, Annual Report 2015).

Public School Support Program (PSSP)

The Government of Punjab launched the Public School Support Program (PSSP) through the Board of Directors (BOD) of Punjab Education Foundation to enhance the quality of education in public schools having low enrollment and poor results. This is a non-profit and non-commercial program. The aim of this program is “to provide free of cost quality education in existing low performing public schools through involvement of private sector under the umbrella of Punjab Education Foundation” To accomplish the commitment of Article 25-A of constitution of Pakistan is “to enhance involvement of private sector to complement efforts of public sector in provision of free and compulsory education for all children of the age 5 to 16 years” The objectives of PSSP are “(a) to increase enrollment in adopted public schools (b) to improve quality of education (c) to provide necessary teaching and learning facilities and (d) to ensure enrollment of Out of School Children (OSC)” The educational chains, NGOs, PEF partner schools, private schools, retired government employees and private individuals fulfilling the criteria laid down in the advertisement sign the partnership agreement with PEF and these persons or organizations are called PSSP licensees.

Continuous Professional Development Program (CPDP)

The Continuous Professional Development Program (CPDP) was established in 2005. The aim of this program was “to promote quality education by providing technical assistance in the form of in-house services training to PEF partner school teachers and head teachers” To ensure the quality of training, these training are monitored and evaluated by experts. CPDP provide training by carrying on Training Need Analysis (TNA) which leads to the identification of the weak areas. CPDP plays an important role in the professional development of teachers. CPDP provides technical and professional assistance to all PEF programs launched in Punjab. This program consists of a core team of professionals who manage administration and a list of Master Trainers (MTs) who train teachers and head teachers. These well-equipped core teams contribute in capacity building and equipping the PEF partner teachers and head teachers with competencies which enhance teacher’s performance and their effectiveness in the classroom activities.

The two training programs introduced for training to PEF partner schools personnel’s are the School Leadership Program (SLP) and Teacher Development Program (TDP). School Leadership Program is introduced to train head teachers of PEF partner schools in the discharge of roles and responsibilities of head teachers, leadership and types of leadership, school improvement and developing parents and community linkages stands topics of the training manual. The Teacher Development Program is introduced to train teachers of PEF partner schools. Classroom management, teaching methodologies, lesson planning, curriculum, security, and safety are the main topics of the training manual. CPDP takes new initiatives to ensure quality education in all PEF partner schools. These initiatives are associated with the certification of

teachers in the name of school mentoring activity (SMA) and early childhood education (ECE) (Punjab Education Foundation, Annual Report 2016).

Academic Development Unit (ADU)

The academic development unit (ADU) of Punjab Education Foundation was established in 2005 to plan and conduct Quality Assurance Test (QAT) for all PEF partner schools. The ADU has a specialist team of English, mathematics, Urdu, physics, chemistry, biology and computer science subjects. They develop question banks for each class and each subject based on the content of Punjab Curriculum and Text Book Board. The subject specialists are responsible for developing QATs for Punjab Education Foundation partner schools. The QATs are based on Bloom's taxonomy. ADU plays a very important role in organizing the in-house conduct and marking of QAT papers for all programs. Generally, one QAT is conducted in every academic year for all programs. Baseline QAT is conducted for all PSSP schools for the first time once these schools are licensed to partners.

Monitoring and Evaluation Department

Monitoring and evaluation is a strategic department that tracks the progress and facilitates decision making. Monitoring and evaluation department is primarily engaged in the collection and evaluation of information from different programs of the PEF. M&E department is designed to monitor all programs of PEF that leads to efficient assessment and evaluation of the development efforts of the organization. M&E keep a close eye on the implementation of all programs and provides critical information to the management related program's performance. M&E is reporting directly to the Board of Directors and the Managing Director (MD) and help the management in making the right decisions with respect to changes in the programs (Punjab Education Foundation, May15, 2018).

Human Resource Department

Human Resource Department plays a leadership role in improving and recruiting the highly qualified staff which identifying and appreciating the value of diversity in the organization. Human resource department acts as an accelerator and enables PEF employees to participate at optimum level towards the performance of the organization. PEF provides an attractive salary package for maintaining the full potential of the employees by providing training and development for career enhancement. It provides a safe, healthy and secure work atmosphere. Human resource department was established “to administer and effectively communicate sound policies, rules and practices that treat employees with dignity and equality” PEF follows a standardized, transparent recruitment and selection procedure which starts with advertising posts through national newspapers, submission of applications, shortlisting, and interviews by nominating committee (Punjab Education Foundation, June 15, 2016).

Admin and Procurement Department

The administrative department is responsible for support services to other departments of the organization in the form of repair and maintenance of office buildings, machines, and equipment. The department administers and regulates matters relating to assets record maintenance and assets management, event management, property administration, security and safety at head office, regional and sub-offices. Procurement department plays a pivotal function in meeting the procurement requirements of different departments. Procurement section is headed by Deputy Director under the supervision of Director HRM & Admin.

Communication Department

The responsibility of the communication department of the PEF is image building, implementation of organizational policies and establishing close liaison with the media community. It ensures better communication and information through the effectual representation of organizational activities in the media. It promotes and sustains a professional relationship with the partners and stakeholders of the educational institutions.

Law Department

Law department provides support in all legal matters to the Punjab Education Foundation.

Finance Department

The Deputy Managing Director Finance is the head of the finance department who is assisted by 20 professionals. Finance and accounts manual has designed standard operating procedures (SOPs) for planning, budgeting, payment verification and processing, fund management and banking operations annually.

Audit Department

The main focus of audit department is to provide transparent, efficient and effective utilization of public money in line with all applicable laws, rules, and regulations governing the Punjab Education Foundation (Punjab Education Foundation, July10, 2018).

4. Presentation and analysis of Results

Table 1: Work Specialization at Punjab Education Foundation Schools

Components of Organizational structure	N	Mean	Std. Dev	df	t	Sig.
1.Work distribution	146	3.130	1.4587	145	25.928	.000
2.Time table adjustment	146	3.233	1.2974	145	30.108	.000
3.Value experienced staff	146	3.534	1.0838	145	39.402	.000
4.Decision making process	146	3.589	1.1306	145	38.358	.000
5.Job satisfaction	146	3.616	1.2332	145	35.434	.000
6.Motivational rewards	146	3.438	1.0304	145	40.321	.000
7.Monitoring of students progress	146	3.616	1.2220	145	35.760	.000
8.Monitoring of teaching staff	146	3.137	1.1242	145	33.716	.000
9.Planning of activities	146	3.541	1.1394	145	37.551	.000
10.Organization of co-curricular activities	146	3.438	.9824	145	42.289	.000

The table 1 shows that the mean score values of all these aspects of work specialization component of organizational structure indicate that PEF partner schools had better schooling structure. The value of t-statistics for all these measures are significant at $\alpha=0.05$.

Table 2: Departmentalization at Punjab Education Foundation Schools

Components of Organizational structure	N	Mean	Std. Dev	df	t	Sig.
1.Follow national curriculum	146	2.877	1.2255	145	28.363	.000
2.Students centered teachings	146	3.418	1.1730	145	35.206	.000
3.Conduction of parents teacher meeting	146	3.514	.9558	145	44.418	.000
4.Appropriate of teacher student ratio	146	3.473	1.2660	145	33.144	.000
5.Financial resources distribution	146	3.432	1.2589	145	32.935	.000
6.Power and authority sharing	146	3.493	.9913	145	42.578	.000
7. Structure organization	146	3.521	1.0649	145	39.946	.000
8.Selection criteria of individuals	146	3.260	.8635	145	45.623	.000
9.Vision of institution	146	3.548	1.0897	145	39.343	.000
10.Strategic planning in the institution	146	2.938	1.3606	145	26.094	.000
11.Communication pattern in teaching staff	146	3.144	1.1507	145	33.014	.000

The table 2 shows that the mean score values of all these aspects of departmentalization operation of organizational structure indicate that PEF partner schools had better structure. The value of t-statistics for all these measures are significant at $\alpha=0.05$.

Table 3: Formalization at Punjab Education Foundation Schools

Components of Organizational structure	N	Mean	Std. Dev	df	t	Sig.
1.Environment of mutual trust and respect	146	2.411	1.1900	145	24.480	.000
2.Monitoring of quality work	146	3.048	.9122	145	40.372	.000
3.Portfolio formation activities	146	2.952	1.0912	145	32.688	.000
4.Schools are properly equipped	146	3.445	1.1509	145	36.171	.000
5.Standard school building	146	3.747	.9742	145	46.467	.000
6.Spacious class rooms	146	1.890	1.2156	145	18.791	.000
7.Matching national standard objectives	146	3.507	.9487	145	44.667	.000
8.Library time period	146	3.466	.9977	145	41.974	.000
9.Feed back mechanism	146	1.904	1.2224	145	18.822	.000
10.Maintenance of school records	146	1.897	1.2246	145	18.720	.000
11.Provision of A. V. Aids	146	3.589	1.0216	145	42.448	.000
12.School Reputation	146	1.938	1.1699	145	20.020	.000

The table 3 shows that the mean score values of all these constituents of formalization component of organizational structure indicate that Punjab Education Foundation partner schools had better structure. The value of t-statistics for all these measures are significant at $\alpha=0.05$.

Table 4: Students Achievement of Punjab Education Foundation Schools

Districts	N	Mean	Standard Deviation	95% Confidence Interval of the difference		t-test	Sig.
				Lower	Upper		
Pakpattan	51	322.97	37.63	312.386	333.551	61.297	.000
Sahiwal	18	289.94	29.11	275.471	304.419	42.264	.000
Okara	77	317.95	35.70	309.853	326.059	78.151	.000

The above table shows the achievement level of PEF partner schools of division Sahiwal. The value of t-statistics is significant at $\alpha=0.05$ for all the districts. The mean score values (322.97, 289.94 & 317.95) indicates that students are learning in these schools performing best. The upper limits (333.551, 304.419 & 326.059) at 95% confidence interval of the difference reveals that students of Punjab Education Foundation partner schools of district Pakpattan obtained high marks as compared to other districts. The order of achievement level among districts: Pakpattan > Okara > Sahiwal.

Table 5: Enrollment Level of Punjab Education Foundation Programs Schools

Fiscal Year	FAS		EVS		NSP		PSSP	
	No. of Schools	Enrollment	No. of Schools	Enrollment	No. of Schools	Enrollment	No. of Schools	Enrollment
2011-2012	2153	1022158	562	126648	430	45690		
2012-2013	2160	1176023	812	122198	444	59024	New Program Started in Fiscal Year 2015-2016	
2013-2014	2311	1299855	1038	208247	618	87822		
2014-2015	3198	1413197	1362	321786	1588	131365		
2015-2016	3266	1696626	1730	416037	2049	193138	996	118296
Total	13088	6607859	5504	1194916	5129	517039	996	118296

Source: Punjab Education Foundation Annual Report 2016

The above table shows that the total PEF-FAS schools were 13088 and total students 6607859 enrolled till June 30, 2016. The PEF-EVS schools were 5504, and total enrollments were 1194916 as on June 30, 2016. The PEF-NSP schools were 5129, and total students learning in these schools were 517039. The PEF started new program PSSP by adopting 996 public schools in the fiscal year 2015-2016. The total enrollments in PEF-PSSP schools were 118296.

Table 6: Yearly Basis Growth of Punjab Education Foundation Programs

Fiscal Year	No. of Schools	Percentage increases over the year	Enrollment	Percentage increases over the year
2011-2012	3145	-	1194496	-
2012-2013	3416	8%	1357245	12%
2013-2014	3967	14%	1595924	15%
2014-2015	6148	35%	1866348	14%
2015-2016	8041	24%	2424097	23%

Source: Punjab Education Foundation, Annual Report 2016

The number of schools and enrollment increases gradually every year. It means PEF is on track with better management and by implementing step forward strategy to ensure enrollment 100% and retention 100%.

5. Conclusion

1. Punjab Education foundation partner schools have a better organizational structure. A large number of activities such as continuous monitoring of the performance of teachers and achievement of students organized in a better way. The teacher student ratio was appropriate in these institutions. The parents' teacher meeting regularly conducted to aware the parents about the study of their children.
2. The students from schools with good organizational structure perform better academically than students from schools with poor organizational structure.
3. The mean score values (322.97, 289.94 & 317.95) indicated that the students are learning in these schools performing best. The upper limits (333.551, 304.419 & 326.059) at 95% confidence interval of the difference also revealed that students of Punjab Education Foundation partner schools of district Pakpattan obtained high marks as compared to other districts. However, there is a large gap in the performance of urban and rural schools. The students are getting high marks of division Sahiwal; same is the case for all divisions of Punjab.
4. The enrollment level also increased day by day due to increased growth of PEF partner schools. The parents bear less financial pressure, whose child learning in these institutions. This is the big step of government and enhanced the value of public, private partnership.

6. Recommendations

1. The selection criteria of teaching staff and Principals of Punjab Education Foundation partner schools should be reviewed and improved because the teachers and principals are selected on the basis of qualification/degrees. These individuals have no professional approach. Minimum academic and professional skills may be made mandatory for Punjab Education Foundation partner schools for the appointment of Principals and teachers.
2. The Punjab Education Foundation should observe the professional approach of the PEF partners. It is seen that business minded individual is operating schools, although, this field needs educationist having a professional approach to giving quality education to society instead of the trend of minting money.

Reference

- Akhtar, S., & Tariq, R. (2015). Status of infrastructure, facilities and level of achievements of the students at secondary school level. *Pakistan Journal of Social Sciences*, 35(1).
- Ashley, L., McLoughlin, C., Aslam, M., Engel, J., Wales, J., & Rawal, S. (2014). *The role and impact of private schools in developing countries: Education rigorous literature review*. United Kingdom: University of London (University of Birmingham).
- Awan, A. G., & Akmal, M. (2015). Punjab education foundations role in enhancing literacy rate: A case study of Multan district Pakistan. *Global Journal of Management and Social Sciences*, 1(1).
- Aziz et al. (2014). Education System Reform in Pakistan: Why, when, and where?, IZA Policy Paper No. 76, Germany: Institute for the Study of Labour (IZA).
- Govt. of Punjab, (2004). *The Punjab Education Foundation Act of 2004*. Lahore: Punjab Gazette, June 9, 2004, Pages 1455-1458.

- Govt. of Punjab, (2005). *The Punjab Education Foundation (Conduct of Business) Rules*, 2005. No.SO.(S-VII)I-33/2004. Lahore: Education Department. October 26, 2005.
- Habib, Z., & Iqbal, M. Z. (2010), Comparison of performance of community model schools and government girls' primary schools in Punjab: A preliminary statistical study. *Pak. J. Statist.* 26(2).
- Larocque, N. (2008). *Public Private Partnership in Basic Education: An International Review*. UK: CfBT Education Trust.
- Malik, A. B. (2011). *Policy Analysis of Education*. Islamabad: United Nations Education Scientific and Cultural Organization.
- Memon, G. R. (2007). Education in Pakistan: The key issues, problems and the new challenges. *Journal of Management and Social Sciences*, 3(1).
- Naz, A., Khan, W., & Khan, N. (2012). Relational analysis of physical facilities in government schools and their impacts on student's academic achievements and behavioral development in Malakand division. *Pakistan Journal of Education* 29(I&II).
- Pandya, S. R. (2011). *School Effectiveness*. New Delhi: A.P.H. Publishing Corporation.
- Punjab Education Foundation, (2015). *Punjab Education Foundation, Annual Report 2015*. Assessed from www.pef.edu.pk.
- Punjab Education Foundation, (2016). *Punjab Education Foundation, Annual Report 2016*. Assessed from www.pef.edu.pk.
- Punjab Education Foundation, (2018, July 10). Assessed from www.pef.edu.pk.
- Punjab Education Foundation, (2018, June 15). Assessed from www.pef.edu.pk.
- Punjab Education Foundation, (2018, May 15). Assessed from www.pef.edu.pk.
- Sharma, M., & Bindal, A. (2014). Public-Private Partnership. *International Journal of Research (IJR)*, 1(7), ISSN 2348-6848.